

**Peter Schweyer, President**  
**Ray O'Connell, Vice President**  
Frank J. Concannon  
Jeanette Eichenwald  
Julio A. Guridy  
Cynthia Y. Mota  
Michael Schlossberg

**Allentown City Council**  
**435 Hamilton Street**  
Allentown, Pa. 18101



AllentownPa.Gov

**COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES**  
**February 15, 2012**  
**COUNCIL CHAMBERS**

**Council Meeting – 7:30 PM**

**1. Invocation: Jeanette Eichenwald**

**2. Pledge to the Flag**

**3. Roll Call:** Concannon (via telephone), Eichenwald, Guridy, Mota, O'Connell, Schlossberg, Schweyer were present.  
Frances Fruhwirth represented for the Solicitor's office

**4. Courtesy of the Floor**

Mr. Harry Proxa, 1522 ½ Chew Street, stated that his pet-peeve is the Morning Call, the restaurants and grocery stores that leave their advertisements. Every Friday, the Morning Call delivers their weekend newspapers and they don't put it where it supposed to be. They place it in the grass areas. He provided pictures of the city and he goes around picking up litter, newspapers and advertisements. He hopes City Council can do something about littering.

Mr. Schweyer stated that Council will accept the literature as his testimony.

Mr. O'Connell stated that he is so right. He sees him picking up trash at 15<sup>th</sup> and Chew and this is a nuisance and he is glad that he is bringing it to the forefront. They don't even get out of the cars or vans they just flipped them. He stated that the latest is the phone book. Every second home, he will throw three out. Not one per home. The Morning Call is responsible for the circulars, they sub-contract and responsible for your phone books. It needs to be addressed by the city administration.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she adds her voice to what Mr. O'Connell just said and thank you for Mr. Proxa's good citizenship. They need to go further and investigate about what they could do about passing an ordinance stopping this. How far they are allowed to go by state regulations and they will proceed with this and thanked him for bringing this to their attention.

Mr. Hershman stated that sometimes he does not get his newspaper. He stated that last year, Mr. Donovan when he was the City Council Budget and Finance Chairman was concerned about the wage tax because Council passed the .35 wage tax increase to help finance unfunded liability of the pension funds. He stated that he found out in the last few weeks why the money is not in those funds. He stated that a lot of W-2s of employees the employers are not withholdings the .35 wage taxes. They are filling out their wage taxes and live in Parkland and Parkland is one percent. We could be out the .35 wage tax because he is sure that Parkland is not going to collect the .35 for us. Someone has to get in touch with the employers and notify them that the wage tax in Allentown is 1.35 or this will continue again. He said that he tells people that live in Allentown that they owe 1.35 and they scream and say why and he says that because City Council passed a wage tax. Some municipalities are not going to collect the .35 percent wage tax.

Mr. Schweyer stated that Council voted against the .35 percent, but it defaulted.

Mr. Dennis Pearson, 942 E Tilghman Street, stated that last Tuesday a young lady from south Bethlehem came before the Bethlehem City Council and spoke that west Bethlehem was the orphan of that city. As president of his neighborhood he is stating that east Allentown is the orphan of this city and even though they all state that they represent east Allentown it's the follow up on issues that they present that concerns him and one of the follow ups that must be done is the having the eastside fire house which supposed to have been promised that if the winter is mild they will have an earlier start on this because it will take six months or so in order to construct it. Don't forget that because there are no east siders on this Council to follow up on the east side firehouse. He stated that a flag pole in Irving Park chain came down and the only way you are going to put a chain on the flag pole is to use one of the fire companies high-rises because it won't get up to the 75 foot level and he suggested they do that as soon as they can because Christmas season is over and they would like to fly the American flag.

Mr. Schlossberg asked Mr. Dougherty to give Council and Mr. Pearson an update.

Mr. Fran Dougherty stated that he actually was made aware of the eastside fire station RFP last week and at the behest of Council that has been putting pressure on the administration concerning on inquiries of the status of the firehouse, he got together with the appropriate staff and the RFP has been awarded to W2A and firm in Allentown on Hamilton Street for the design build. He stated that City Council has been keenly involved with this and pushing the administration getting this going.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she was proud that the project was going to begin and that an Allentown firm has been chosen.

Mr. Schweyer asked Mr. Dougherty to follow up on the flagpole issue as well.

Mr. Dougherty stated that is a specialized task and not a task for the fire department. He stated that he dealt with many issues like this in the past with higher flagpoles and he will look into it.

Ms. Angela Mitchell, potential buyer of 556 N. 4<sup>th</sup> Street, thanked City Council for the opportunity to present her concern on the blighted/redevelopment property that she is still interested in purchasing. She contacted Julio Guridy, Mayor Pawlowski, Ismael Arcelay, Jennifer Smethers, Arthur Suarez, the Redevelopment Board and director, David Paulus, Leonard Lightner, George Middlecamp, Carmen Dragotta, Gary Ritter, William Harvey, Angel Padilla, and Joseph Gill and the reason why she is here tonight because she wants to express her concerns about the redevelopment property that she was supposed to purchase and close on January 9<sup>th</sup> 2012 from Carlos and Aurora Perrotis, the seller. This property received a pre-sale certification of compliance on June 1, 2011 from Angel Padilla and the City of Allentown Housing Inspector and Barbara Nemith, City of Allentown Zoning Officer on November 28<sup>th</sup>, 2011 she hired Joseph Polosky from Advantage Inspection Services to do her home inspection and he found major code violations, health and environmental issues. She notified and forwarded to Jennifer Smethers a copy of abandoned home inspection report on November 29<sup>th</sup> and she immediately notified Leonard Lightner, and Ms. Smethers informed her on November 2011 that Mr. Lightner reviewed the inspection report and had a few questions for the inspector who completed the inspection and gave a time to meet with the inspector late tomorrow morning and she will let her know what she heard. Mr. Lightner went to the property and sent someone out to inspect the property on November 31 and December 1<sup>st</sup> and she sent a copy of the mold and radon report on December 2<sup>nd</sup> then on December 7<sup>th</sup>, Ms. Smethers sent a copy of the Advantage Home Inspection Report via mail and when she circled the eleven violations and eleven housing code violations and explained to the seller that the circled items are the code violations that she needs to meet RACA's requirements. On December 15<sup>th</sup>, Mr. Padilla met with Carolos Perrotis, the seller, to inspect the property a second time and Mr. Padilla called while he was on the premises and she explained in detail to him on the eleven housing code violations that Ms. Smethers circled on the Advantage Home Inspection report and the location of the mold, but however, when she reviewed Mr. Padilla's final inspection report dated December 30<sup>th</sup> he gave the property another clear certificate of compliance, but only for code violations that were cited, completed and mold was not included on this report. She is here trying to understand the role does the Building Standards and Safety play because she is getting know where with this matter. The property still has violations and nothing has been done to correct the violation, but they want to sell the property at the same price and they don't want to make the repairs or accept the credits.

Mr. Guridy stated that he did speak to Ms. Mitchell and has also spoken to Mr. Paulus and they look like they are looking into it and has been working with Ms. Mitchell and Mr. Padilla on this property. However, he thinks she indicated that she is not satisfied with the report and the finding of her reports from Advantage Inspections and what he would like to do is ask Mr. Dougherty to please follow up on behalf of Council and get back to us.

Mr. Schweyer asked Ms. Mitchell for her contact information and make sure that Council has it and will make sure that the appropriate follow up has been completed.

Mr. Guridy asked to put a timeline on this and within a couple of weeks they will be able to complete this report.

Ms. Mitchell stated that as far as Mr. Paulus, she received an email from him last week and he is saying that the owners are refusing him to come into the property and there is nothing more he could do in this matter, but when she went to the Redevelopment meeting last night they were saying that he requested a search warrant to get into the property to further investigate the matter because these are hazardous conditions.

Mr. Schweyer asked Mr. Dougherty to provide Council with the results of his findings.

Mr. Hunsicker, 1051 N. 19<sup>th</sup> Street, asked the status of the 15<sup>th</sup> Street Bridge. Will this be another five or ten year project?

Mr. Schweyer stated that the short answer is no.

Mr. Young stated that the project currently has a contractor on board JD Eckman is the contractor for the project. The project was a design build and he is doing some design work which includes some environmental permitted and the permit applications have been submitted and just today they got back a letter that the one permit application has been completed and will be moving forward. They still have additional permits and it looks like at this point in time, physical construction and demolition of existing bridge would likely start sometime in March.

Mr. Hunsicker asked of this year.

Mr. Young stated of this year, 2012.

Mr. John Ingram, South Allentown, stated that he would like to read a letter from Ed Pawlowski dated February 1<sup>st</sup>. He stated that Mayor Pawlowski did not call him prior to the letter going out. He received it on Monday, February 6<sup>th</sup> and he tried to call him on this day. He tried his cellphone and his office and he has not returned his calls. The letter reads as follows:

February 1, 2012,

Dear Mr. Ingram:

I want to personally thank you for the years of service and outstanding work you provided the city by serving on the Planning Commission. The accomplishments of this board and others are achieved through people like you who show an interest in working towards improving how government works. Your time and dedication to the Planning Commission has indeed been most appreciated. My best wishes to you and all your future endeavors and again, thank you for your service.

Sincerely,

Ed Pawlowski

He knows why Mayor Pawlowski has sent this letter out. He has been openly critical of the arena process and if he would have called him and they would have had a chat on the telephone as he feels he should have, he could picture

him calling and saying hey John what is going on what is the matter with you, get off my you know what. You have been over the top on this thing and I would have responded and said well Ed if you would have been a little more inclusive in the process and transparent in the process, we could have avoided a lot of this. This is the kind of letter that would have been sent out to someone who already resigned. He stated that he did not resign. He is giving me all kinds of compliments about my service and I am not going to resign until the City Council votes on a new appointee and he assumes that is coming up because essentially what he is doing is firing me. He has the right and power to do that. This is kind of reflection of the way he operates. He stated that he has been supportive of Ed particularly with the Queen City Airport Project and on a lot of other things and feels that he does a bang up job in a lot of areas. He stated that he has been supportive of him on the Waterfront Plan which has been a more inclusive process by the way which he supports, but in regards to the arena project you know the issues that he is talking about. The city is getting screwed over with regards to what the city budget is going to reap from this which is practically nothing. No city property taxes, no rent, or hardly any rent. Dropping to zero and the debt service on this thing is costing \$160 million and should cost \$100 million by the way. The debt service will be over \$8 million on the bond and it could be \$5 million instead and will come out of the NIZ. Where are the NIZ revenues and where are the arena revenues or projected revenues and where is the fiscal impact and where is the financial feasibility analysis and the market analysis.

Mr. O'Connell asked when your term expires. He stated that they spoke this morning.

Mr. John Ingram stated that his term officially expired January of last year. As did the terms of two others whose terms expired in 2011 and 2010 who are still sitting on the Planning Commission.

Mr. O'Connell stated that he told Mr. Ingram this morning and will tell him now for the public record. If you feel that Ed Pawlowski has a vendetta against you John Ingram then you need to talk to Ed Pawlowski. We understand and we are a sounding board, but Ed Pawlowski appoints various recommendations for people in the community and he appoints people on authorities, boards and commissions. We approve or disapprove those appointments. Obviously, when your term expired in January 2011 you went almost a whole year to January 2012 and basically he is saying via this letter is he is not choosing to reappoint you for whatever reason they are.

Mr. Ingram asked why he didn't just say that in the letter. He believes in straight talk.

Mr. O'Connell stated that he is straight talking and you need to set up an appointment with Ed Pawlowski and you and Ed Pawlowski need to pound it out behind closed doors. He stated that Mr. Ingram has every right to make an appointment with Ed Pawlowski and talk this through. If he did not reappoint you because what you are saying, he is the only person that can answer that. He asked Mr. Dougherty to facilitate a meeting with Mr. Ingram and Mayor Pawlowski. He would be more than happy as a Councilperson to sit there and help facilitate the meeting.

Mr. Kenneth Heffentrager, 11<sup>th</sup> and Washington, stated besides for going after the Morning Call go after the condemned businesses and companies because all the trash in front of all the blighted properties that's their responsibilities too. He thinks that the number is a lot higher than 642 for the blighted properties. They are falling apart and the colonial barbershop here is not tag and two days ago there was a piece laying on the sidewalk. He is pushing the barriers back. The property owners need to clean up their place whether they are lived in or not.

## **5. Approval of Minutes: January 31, 2012 and February 1, 2012**

Minutes approved by common consent.

## **6. Old Business**

Mr. Schwyer stated that once again, they have the reorganization on tap. Council voted on the vice president which is Ray O'Connell. They are going to have the election for president. Any objections to that, hearing none, he believes that Mr. Hanlon and Ms. Fruhwirth put names in a hat. Once again, he would like to remind folks both Mr. Guridy and himself put their names forward for the office of president of Council and they are going to draw first as customary to be the first person to be voted on.

Mr. Hanlon stated that he drew already and pulled Mr. Guridy.

Mr. Schweyer asked Mr. O'Connell does he feel comfortable in handling this part of the vote.

Mr. O'Connell stated sure. Mr. Guridy has been nominated for president, is that true.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if the procedure allow for comments before the vote.

Mr. O'Connell that sure, any comments on Mr. Guridy.

Mr. Guridy stated that his letter to Council was very specific and he has been on Council for eleven years and was the vice president for five years. He stated that he gave up his vice presidency even though he was nominated again for a six term so that someone else could have it. He stated that Mr. D'Amore became president for a while and when Mr. D'Amore was ready to leave, he passed on the presidency as an interim position to Mr. Schweyer and Mr. Schweyer has been serving that role for the last four months. He stated that he is at a point that being the vice president and every committee as a chair of the committee with the exception of the finance committee that was developed recently and he is ready to take over as president with honor.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she would like to speak on the candidacy of Mr. Julio Guridy for president. As Mr. Guridy just stated this is his eleventh year serving on City Council. He served as vice president for five years, chaired not on one major committee, but every committee. She would like to point out one other factor, this year when the opportunity arose for Mr. Guridy to run for state office, he declined that opportunity stating unequivocally that he is dedicating himself to the city and will complete his term of office. That deserves our respect and our recognition and for all those reasons, she is very pleased to support the candidacy of Julio Guridy for president of City Council.

Mr. O'Connell asked were there any other comments for Julio Guridy. He asked if it would be a roll call vote and the roll call vote would be whether they vote yes for Mr. Guridy for president or we do not want Mr. Guridy, we would vote no.

Mr. Hanlon stated that on the vote for Mr. Guridy as Council president passed, 4 – 3 (O'Connell, Schlossberg, Schweyer)

Mr. Schweyer asked for the vote again so that they could unanimously appoint Mr. Guridy as Council president.

Mr. Guridy stated that he would be honored.

Mr. Schweyer made the motion to vote again.

Mr. Schlossberg seconded the motion.

Vote for Mr. Guridy as Council president passed, 7 – 0

Mr. Guridy thanked Mr. Concannon for holding on for so long. He knows that Mr. Concannon's wife is sick and he is taking the time to do this on behalf of the citizens of Allentown. He stated that Mr. Schweyer took over when Mr. D'Amore had to take off and served Council honorably and did a wonderful job as the interim president and at the same time was very patient with us and appreciate Mr. Schweyer's support our community as the president of Council and Mr. Schlossberg became vice president for a short time and also did a wonderful job. Mr. O'Connell, you are the new vice president and I congratulate you again and is sure they can work together to make sure that we deliver wonderful meetings and serve the public we honor. He thanked Ms. Eichenwald and Ms. Mota for their support.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she looks forward to his leadership.

Mr. Guridy asked Mr. Schweyer if he would like to continue the meeting for tonight he would be happy to take cover next time.

Mr. Schweyer stated that is big of you, but you waited eleven years for this, why wait another two weeks.

Mr. O'Connell asked Mr. Hanlon was Mr. Concannon going to stay on for the entire Council meeting because we have some important votes coming up and he does not want to impose upon Mr. Concannon, he is taking care of his wife.

Ms. Eichenwald thanked Ms. Mitchell for presenting her issue tonight in a public forum because at the last public safety meeting many of the citizens spoke about blighted properties and it is an enormous concern for all of us and we share your concerns on your particular properties. She stated that she did some research and in 2007 there were a little over 200 blighted properties in the entire city and in 2012 a little over four years later, we have close to 700 blighted properties. Once upon a time, the Redevelopment Authority was run by Dr. Beck-Pooley, a Ph.D. from the University of Pennsylvania and a consonant professional who will come time after time come to the meetings and share information on the blighted properties and the procedure went forward in the way in which it should. Have we still had the system, she is sure a lot of the problems Ms. Mitchell would have be alleviated. Unfortunately, the administration in her consideration and a lack of foresight decided to eliminate that position and turn over the responsibility of blighted properties as part of Ms. Hailstone and the Community and Economic Development department. Ever since that occurred, it is her opinion and the opinion of many people to whom she have spoken that the blighted properties are not receiving the attention that they deserve. She stated that if she was living next door to a blighted property she would be exceedingly upset. She thinks that as City Council it is incumbent of us to follow this through. Mr. Paulus is overworked and she recognizes that, but once the administration accepted the responsibility to follow through on processing blighted properties, they needed to do it. This is blight on the entire city. It decreases property values and impacts on the quality of life and creates litter as we heard as well and for that and a myriad of other reasons the administration said they would accept responsibility of blighted properties and it is incumbent of City Council to make sure that happens.

Mr. Schweyer stated that he would take what Ms. Eichenwald is saying and go in a slightly different direction. Our sentiments are the same. When over the past few years he was chair of the blighted property review board and they are looked after in a different manner than they were, but properties that have fallen in disrepair and has fallen into blighted property list are no longer getting the attention they deserve because quite honestly we are still waiting for the administration to reappointment people to the blighted property review board. He stated that Mr. Dougherty's predecessor had heard this for three to four meetings that they are all waiting for their reappointments for the blighted property review board, but for properties that are not on the said list, but still fall in the category of blight at least in practicality as opposed to legality they need to do so. He renewed his request to have the members of the administration appoint members of the blighted property review board.

## **7. Communications**

### **8. REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES:**

Budget and Finance: Chairperson Schlossberg

The committee hasn't met since the last meeting; the next meeting is scheduled for February 22<sup>nd</sup> at 6:00 PM..

Public Safety: Chairperson Eichenwald

The committee has not met since the last council meeting; the next meeting is scheduled for March 7<sup>th</sup>.

Community and Economic Development: Chairperson Schweyer

The Committee has not met since the last Council meeting; the next meeting is scheduled for March 14<sup>th</sup> –the Committee will meet the Wednesday between the regularly scheduled council meetings along with Public Works and the times and order will be determined by the agenda items.

Parks and Recreation: Chairperson Mota

The Committee met this evening; the next meeting is scheduled for March 21<sup>st</sup> –the committee will meet before the second regularly scheduled council meeting, the third Wednesday of the month.

Public Works: Chairperson O'Connell

The Committee has not met since the last Council meeting; the next meeting is scheduled for March 14<sup>th</sup>.

Human Resources, Administration and Appointments: Chairperson Concannon

The Committee has not met since the last Council meeting; a future meeting has not yet been scheduled.  
Rules, Chambers, Intergovernmental Relations and Strategy: Chairperson Guridy  
The Committee has not met since the last Council meeting; a future meeting has not yet been scheduled

Mr. O'Connell stated that he will be the City Council representative for the Allentown Parking Authority. He stated that he was appointed by Mayor Pawlowski to serve on that authority and will be City Council representative for the Shade Tree Commission.

#### **OTHER COMMITTEE REPORTS**

None

#### **CONTROLLER'S REPORT**

Ms. Koval stated that she will have a report once she meets with the finance department.

#### **9. APPOINTMENTS: None**

#### **10. ORDINANCES FOR FINAL PASSAGE:**

##### **Bill 2 Shade Tree Amendment**

Amends Article 911, Shade Trees, Section 911.03 by requiring a permit and fee of \$10 for each tree (not to exceed \$100) for all work done to shade trees in the public-right-of-way, establishing a permit and fee of \$10 to remove vegetation encroaching on the public right of way and establishing a license and annual \$50 fee for professional tree services to perform arboricultural work in the city.

Ms. Mota stated that it was voted favorably 3-0.

Mr. Guridy asked if it was anything from the administration or anything from the members.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if this is the first time a fee has been recommended for Shade Tree.

Mr. Weitzel stated yes, it is a permit for removal, planting, pruning and any work done on a Shade Tree that involves an ISA certified arborist.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if she wanted a tree planted on her property and one removed she would call the parks department and they would put her on a schedule.

Mr. Weitzel said yes.

Ms. Eichenwald asked what happens to those people that the tree needs to be removed for safety reasons or environmental reasons.

Mr. Weitzel stated that they have a shade tree inspector who in a perfect world would recognize that problem and would issue a notice to the homeowner that their tree is in need of removal and at that point the homeowner will then get a list from us of certified arborist that are licensed to work within the city and there are thirteen on that list now to perform the work at that point that arborist will come into our office and get a permit for that work to be done and that notifies that shade tree inspector that he needs to go out and observe that work and make sure it is state standards.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if he checks the qualifications of the arborists. Is there such thing as a licensing book or a book or licensed arborists?

Mr. Weitzel stated that they have to be an ISA certification and they are requiring that of our arborist as part of the shade tree ordinance. You must be certified and pass a test that we give them as well to be able to work in the city.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if the surrounding municipalities have the same process.

Mr. Weitzel stated that he can't speak to because the shade tree commission did most of the work and research. The chairman is here tonight. Mr. Fey can you answer that.

Mr. Fey stated that most municipalities in the area have shade tree commissions; if not do they have an EAC board that oversees public right of way of trees.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if they had a license fee structure.

Mr. Fey stated yes, in many instances in the area there is a structure for permitted fees and that goes towards any type of arboriculture work. The international society of arboriculture is a worldwide organization and they have standards and ethics that each of the gentlemen must maintain. We have up the ante of the professionalism of the work that needs to be done. The training and testing is done by the ISA so that it is fair to everybody and the City of Allentown is not liable to these people as far as the work.

Ms. Eichenwald asked Mr. Fey does he feel that this fee will inhibit the homeowners from wanting to do the more tree planting.

Mr. Fey stated as the ordinance goes, if a tree is removed, it has to be replaced unless there are circumstances. The initial thought is that if a tree is removed and the planting is done in the next planting season there will be only one permit needed and that way you would not have a \$20 dollar fee, it would be a \$10 fee. There is a capping on this where as if a person had thirty trees on their property in street line that they will have no obligation to pay \$300 dollars. We put a cap on as \$100 so it would be not as detrimental to the property owner.

Mr. Schweyer stated to Mr. Weitzel and Ms. Eichenwald that it is not every tree on your property. It is just trees and shrubbery in the public right of way.

Mr. Weitzel stated that is a point of clarification because some municipalities do require rights of removal on personal property trees.

Mr. Guridy asked was it anything from Council, the administration or the public.

Mr. Tom Costa, 510 Mountainville Park Road, stated that he is against this ordinance to institute a fee. All you are doing is putting more fees trees on people working in the City of Allentown and the property owners. He stated that he does not see it as necessary as a property owner in the City of Allentown he was subject to a minor fee like this and that fee has grown to a substantial problem with the licenses of rental properties. He stated that he is against it and if they must or feel that their position of a body is to support something like this, he would encourage and challenge them to come up with equal cuts to the general budget on the money that would be raised for this. It is time to stop putting more fees on property owners and the people that work in the City of Allentown. It is enough.

Ms. Eichenwald asked Mr. Weitzel how much he estimates that it cost the parks department to service the trees.

Mr. Weitzel stated that they have a full-time clerk and a full-time shade tree inspector and both of those positions are in the tune of \$100,000 with benefits for the two positions. They almost solely work on shade trees. These permits fees they anticipate will raise approximately \$5,000 a year.

### **Ordinance passed, 5 – 1 (Eichenwald)**

#### **Bill 8 Refunding**

Refunding of General Obligation Bonds, Series of 2003 Bonds, General Obligation Bonds, Series of 2012

Mr. Schlossberg stated that it was in the Committee of the Whole and forwarded favorably and a result in a significant savings for a variety of our bonds.

Mr. O'Connell stated that he believes that savings was for \$285,000.

Mr. Shearer stated \$280,000.

Mr. O'Connell asked Mr. Strathearn that he had said roughly it would go to general debt service or a one-time project.

Mr. Strathearn stated that it would be for a one-time project or the unrestricted reserve. It will not be used for recurring items.

Mr. O'Connell asked if Mr. Strathearn will keep City Council inform on where the \$280,000 will go to.

Mr. Guridy asked Council or the public if they had any questions or comments.

**Ordinance passed, 6 – 0**

**11. ORDINANCES FOR INTRODUCTION: None**

**12. CONSENT AGENDA:**

**CA-1** Certificates of Appropriateness for Work in the Historic Districts

**Resolution passed, 6 – 0**

**13. RESOLUTIONS ON SECOND READING:**

**R1 Dedication: Bill T. Sabo Memorial Tennis Courts at Jordan Park**

Ms. Mota stated that they received a few letters of support and it was voted favorably 3 – 0.

Mr. Guridy asked City Council or the public were there any questions or comments.

**Resolution passed, 6 – 0**

Mr. O'Connell stated that since the resolution passed 6 – 0, do we have a timeline or are you going to work on the timeline to get in touch with the family.

Mr. Weitzel stated that they envision doing something similar that they did in the past. The family, the son lives in Washington, but he knows that there is other family that is here. He thanked them for passing it and stated that they will start working on that and make sure Council is notified when that event is going to occur.

Mr. O'Connell stated that maybe they could do it in conjunction with the Summer Embrace Your Dreams Tennis Program for the youth of Allentown.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she is so pleased that this resolution passed and during the committee meeting she was fortunate to have Ms. Thomas talk about the Embrace your Dreams program and there was a family here to speak on the impact that it has on their children and on the whole community. It is an advancement for the City of Allentown and thanked Mr. Weitzel for bringing this forward.

**R3 Delta Thermo Energy Agreement**

Authorizes the Administration to enter into an Agreement with Delta Thermo Energy A, LLC for Waste to Energy Services to be provided at a Waste to Energy Facility to be constructed by Delta Thermo Energy A, LLC on Certain City Property.

Mr. O'Connell stated that he would like to hold his comments until they hear from the general public. He thinks that he heard quite a bit over his two years and two month about the Delta Thermo Energy Project and last week Ms. Eichenwald did a wonderful job asking many questions, more environmental questions then financial questions and they were addressed appropriately, but since then people came out in fairness about the project and he would like to hear the courtesy of those people before they vote on this.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she agrees with Mr. O'Connell and the environmental voice is the voice that has been lacking in the discussions and she looks forward to hearing from members of the community.

Mr. Richard Young stated that it might have been a misimpression or miscommunication at last week's meeting about the consultants that they had onboard. It may be been left with an impression that both consultants both signed on to the technology. What they done is sign on to the agreement, not the technology.

Ms. Eichenwald stated to Mr. Young that she just does not understand that concept that they signed off on the agreement, but not the technology and they are our consultants.

Mr. Young stated that what he is trying to say is that the agreement has protections in for the city. It wasn't on the technology itself, the technology does have risks as with landfilling, landfilling has risks and what we are currently doing has some risks to it. We could wind up in a situation where something is submitted to be landfilled today; in the future may not permitted which could cause problems for the city in the future.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that it is very disconcerting to her. We are now being told if the consultants did not sign off on the technology which is certainly not the impression she had last week.

Mr. Young stated that he realize it.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that it is disconcerting in the last possible we are told that our consultants did not sign off on the technology which to her, the members of City Council, everyone sitting here today and every citizen of the City of Allentown is really the issue.

Mr. Marc Feller stated that he personally spoke to the engineers prior to this meeting and over the last few days. The way it could be characterized that it is relatively new technology comprised of three components and each one of which has functioned and shown to work independently, but was not used together and the company Delta thermo Energy does not have significant enough experience operating one of these facilities and we all know that. One of our engineers stated that he could not say with any amount of certainty that this technology is going to work because the reasons that have been laid out. The other engineer feels it will work and feels positively that the technology will work. As Mr. Young was saying, the engineers focused on the contract and does the contract provides technology to the city and if the technology turns out not to work and could be manifested in so many ways the plant simple may not turn on and function the way it supposed to. It may not meet the requirements of the Department of Environmental Protection and may not get permits. It may not operate as efficiently as it was designed to operate. The contract was written to provide protection to the city in the event that the plant is not functioning in the way it supposed to function. Through alternative means the city will have waste disposal and the city does not have to pay for any waste disposal that is not receiving from Delta.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that it is gobbledygook to her. We heard last week that the consultants said that everything is fine. She does not want to reiterate what she just said. It is distressing and the process has become exceedingly difficult.

Mr. Strathearn stated that what is presented and he wants to make sure that the Council understands in terms of the landfill situation, there risks involved with that. There are risks to do with solid waste of any sort and it's a balancing in establishing an effective and efficient way in getting rid of our garbage cost going forward and the agreement has taken 14 months to be drafted and probably 30 reiterations to get it to protect the city on a business sense, a technological sense going forward. It was always clear as with anything with this type of business, there are environmental risks and there aren't anything that you work with that you done everything to make sure A the city is

protected and B that plant does not operate if it does not meet state standards. It is embedded and cemented in the agreement that the plant has to meet Pennsylvania environmental standard USCB standards. Just like any other manufacturing plants or any business. When it is operating, it will be monitored. Every, I have been dotted and T's have been crossed for the protection of the city.

Mr. O'Connell went back to Mr. Feller and asked the two engineers one said yes, one said no.

Mr. Feller stated that John Sales is here tonight, and he is the engineer that felt positive about the technology and the other engineer said they were evaluating proposals and each proposal had its risks. In looking at the proposal from Delta they said looking at the components of the facility and here are questions on whether this will work or that will work and we cannot conclude that we know that this technology is going to work because we have never seen it operate and have not seen this company operate an identical facility. They felt that they did not have enough evidence to conclude to the city this technology is going to work.

Mr. Young stated that is why he said that neither one has signed on or signed off on the technology. They did not have enough evidence at that point to give an opinion one way or another. Mr. Sales does feel that it will work. He stated that he by no means know enough about this technology, but he knows enough about science that he thinks what they are saying sounds plausible to him.

Ms. Mota asked what the main concerns were. What are the main risks that you see?

Mr. Young stated some of the risks for this technology are one being able to get an air quality permit from DEP. The second risk is if they do get the permit, that permit is going to require air quality monitoring and if the measurements that are being made as part of the requirement don't meet the requirements of the permits, the permits will get pulled. Those are the risks. With this agreement, our absolute worst case scenario is that we will go back doing what we do today.

Ms. Eichenwald asked if the City of Allentown pay for both expert opinions.

Mr. Young stated yes.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that they never heard or seen the report. They have never been here. Delta Thermo many times brought experts that come from Japan, Germany or Korea and they never met the engineering expert from Virginia. We only met with the engineer that says yes.

Mr. Young stated that they are from Virginia.

Mr. Schlossberg stated to Ms. Eichenwald as he stated at both meetings, these reports have both been available for months. The contact information for both engineers has been available for months. If you did have questions on this report like he did, he spoke to both engineers, you were more than free to reach out to them as many on this dais. It is a valid point that you have not heard from this engineer, but if he is in Virginia and Mr. Sale is in Bethlehem Township that is probably a good reason. If you had questions about this report he would encourage her to contact the engineers directly.

Mr. Young stated that Mr. Sales is a resident of Allentown.

Mr. Feller stated that the other firm GDB even though they had some reservations, they worked very closely with us on the contract. All the way through, notwithstanding, their view on the technical, scientific aspect, they worked with us to make sure that this contract is as good as it could be and gave us valuable information. It is not a situation of they looked at the technology, and said it is never going to work and said they did not want anything to do with this again. They worked with us, knowing the city was interested in doing this and their goal was to help us provide the protections that would benefit the city in the fullest extent.

Mr. Joe Hilliard, south Allentown, congratulated Mr. Guridy. He stated that it is good to see him sitting in the chair. Based on Ms. Eichenwald's leadership last week and her conversations and few alarm bells and suspicions he just heard in this exchange he has alarm bells went off. He stated that we all know risks and Ms. Mota for the environmental aspects the biggest risks are the dioxins emissions. They are very poisonous toxins that if it gets into the food supply and any good engineering plan would design to minimize risks. When he put together the information, he put together a process map and identified a couple glaring loopholes and he cannot believe he is saying it as a well-known limited public activist. The regulations of dioxins seem to be lacking as far as he could see. The only testing environment of the DEP is the flu gas and when Ms. Eichenwald was asking the questions something triggered in the back of his mind. There will be 24 hours of continuous monitoring, yes of sulfur dioxide, nitroside, carbon monoxide and CO2, but not of dioxins. There is no technology to do 24 hour continuous monitoring of dioxins. The DEP requirements are the startup, second quarter, third quarter and annual. He stated that a gentleman said that they won't meet the DEP requirements. How many dioxins are we going to be pumping every day pumping into the air before we find out there is a problem. There are some common sense recommendations and he strongly urged Council to table this for now, readdress the risks, and implement some common sense ordinances. You can exceed DEP requirements. He asked about the ash and the water treatment plant and dioxins.

Mr. Schlossberg asked Mr. Sale to respond to Mr. Hilliard's concerns if he could.

Mr. Sale stated that Mr. Hilliard is correct about the continuous emissions monitoring system. The requirements for the CMS are nox sox and there will be some like CO monitoring for production efficiency and CO2 monitoring for greenhouse gas emissions. He is correct, there is no or he has not seen any requirements for dioxins monitoring. The formation of dioxins are being dealt with plant design and is to the RRS and has about 90 percent reduction in the chlorides as they enter the fuel supply. You will get a reduction there. The temperature is correct, you have to be in higher temperatures over 1400 degrees so that you have complete combustion and not have dioxin formation, however, you go through your flugas system and you have residents times lower dioxin might form in the post combustion areas and what you are trying to do is minimize the times formation enters in the dioxins. The scrubbers that DEP will be providing will scrub out these particles and a fabric baghouse will be collecting the particles. There will be minimal possibility of dioxins in the atmosphere; however, there will be dioxins collected different points in the process.

Mr. Schlossberg stated that in Mr. Sale's expert opinion that the dioxins emissions into the atmosphere will be minimum.

Mr. Sale stated yes.

Mr. Hilliard asked should that be monitored and measured in a cost effective manner.

Mr. Sale stated that he thinks it should be monitored.

Mr. O'Connell stated that dioxins have been characterized by EPA as likely to be human carcinogen and are anticipated to increase the risks of cancer as background levels of exposures. Is that statement true or false?

Mr. Sale stated that he is not qualified to answer on a human exposure.

Mr. O'Connell asked if dioxins were harmful to human beings.

Mr. Sales stated yes.

Mr. Pearson stated as president of the east Allentown Rittersville Association, you must know that this is in our backyard across the river. We are very concerned about what is happening. We have dealt with so-called minor issues coming of western Lehigh County which causes great problems for our area. This is right across from us, the 14<sup>th</sup> ward and the 15<sup>th</sup> ward, 16<sup>th</sup> ward and Southside. We want to make sure. You say it's a city risk to us it's more than a city risk, it's a personal risk. These dioxins and other chemicals are released in the atmosphere. When Agere

was here initially there was dangerous items coming from there and they corrected that, and now they are gone. We have to be assured that would not be a repeat of it. They supposed to be our representatives, but none of them live in the danger zone, nor our State Representatives. We don't want to be the people that would be hit with cancer down the line.

Mr. Ernie Atiyeh, 1740 Primrose Lane – Northampton, stated that it was a year and half or two years ago when they originally started talking about this. They were going to build a test model, has that been done or is it going to be done.

Mr. Sale stated that it is a bench scale demonstration that is in operation in Atlantic County. It is being demonstrated right now as a demonstration of a RRS which is the fuel preparation component and the water treatment system is processing the water that comes from the RSS and that is being demonstrated right now.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she has done some reading about that and that has only two components and the testing is done on two pounds of trash and what we are talking about tons and tons of trash. It is very, very small and only two of the components. We have not seen that there is an existing model.

Mr. Al Wurth, 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue in Bethlehem, stated that he is here because he is a member of the Sierra Club, Waste Committee Chairperson for the Pennsylvania Chapter and a member of the executive committee of the Lehigh Valley and they sent a letter to Council and sent a letter a few days ago and wanted to reiterate that the Sierra Club is taking a position in response to this proposal and urging the Council to regret it. He stated that they had a lot of experience with the Sierra Club and environmentally concerned citizens with issues regarding incinerators. When he heard this proposal which he testified before them in October 2010 he sent a letter at that time and has included in the letter to Council. He stated that he worried about the nature of the proposal. Incinerators are a mid-twenty century technology and not being adopted in the country anymore and there are many reasons for that, but he thought that when hearing the proposals that this process would actually simply go by because it was an inexperienced company and it would be a large gamble, very risky and scheduled for the heart of Allentown. He stated that he was surprised when it reached the news again basically a month and half ago because it dropped below the radar. When he heard that the Council was voting on it tonight, he was very upset and he wanted to make the points they wanted to make about it. He concurred with almost all the objections being raised by all the other citizens here. It is very important because dioxins are very risky and a risk to be synthesized in the stacks and the cooler parts of the stacks even if the temperatures in the burners are maintained at a high level and it is important to remember that the original Harrisburg incinerator that is quite notorious was the single source of dioxins in the country. This one was than rebuilt and caused Harrisburg to go bankrupt. He knows the people that is sponsoring this project does not consider it a conventional incinerator, but they will be combusting waste in order to generate electricity and the combustion product will be released through a smokestack and released in an area in the most part upwind of the poorer and more minority racial and ethnic group of Allentown. Incinerators are known to be in areas of the weak and powerless.

Mr. Guridy stated that Mr. Wurth's time is up, unless he is speaking on behalf of the Sierra Club.

Mr. Wurth stated that he gave a three-page letter with a resolution sponsored by a local group. Incinerators need trash you do not recycle when you have incinerators to feed the beast. His prediction came out because the new thing about this contract is there is someone coming sideways to make sure we continue to feed the beast just in case Allentown wouldn't which discourages recycling which is the most economical and sway to deal with waste. We don't want waste to burn. Waste is inheritably inefficiency. When you inhibit recycling and when you have a demand for waste to operate this process, if you recycle well you will import more waste. That's the nature of this contract. This contract locks in the capacity of DTE to bring waste elsewhere if Allentown does not meet its 720 tons a week. The capacity has been up since the last time he read it and there is an eleven percent start-up on imported waste that could be tracked. All the waste heads back into town. They have imported resources and exported waste. You will be importing waste and returning your waste to the heart of town and then burning it and putting it into the air. You can't do anything that is more at odds with the concept of waste than that. Bethlehem had an incinerator plan back in the 80s and it fell through, but at least they put it downhill and downstream where their landfill is. They did not put it back into the center of town and bring all the trucks and tractor trailers for of trash in town. Sludge contains

heavy metals and all sorts of pesticide residues and has radioactive materials in it because all our smoke detectors have radioactive materials. Household discharge is full of radioactive materials. They end up in the water and you are bringing in waste already with your sludge delivery from the entire Lehigh County area. He urged Council not to do this self-inflicted wound.

Mr. Peter Crownfield, Fountain Hill, stated that he is speaking primarily as individual, but also a coordinator of sustainability and health initiative in sustainable communities. You talked about risks and how secure the contract is. It is amazing because he believes the protections are very poor. The biggest risk is not if the company fails to meet some permit requirements. The biggest risk is borne out of the long history of regulation is that 15 years now they will discover that something that they have been doing has been harming your citizens whether it is cancer or birth defects or any other of many scenarios, it is happening over and over again. They will discover that people water is being poisoned and animals are dying. This is the history of regulation always playing catch-up. We will do this and that if we are required to do so, that is a really lousy basis for the health of your citizens. DEP's record on enforcing reasonable protection is very poor for years and getting worst. In the Marcelo Shell inspectors were ordered not to even give citations to the violators, but return it to Harrisburg to be reviewed before it is issued. It has become a police process. This is the DEP. You cannot count on them to protect your citizens. He stated that by the way most of us live downwind too and counting on the DEP requirement is not going to protect your citizens. In the contract, it says if it is a default or they are not meeting all the requirements they have 15 days to correct it unless they can't correct it in 15 days, there is no default. That is the protection that is the secure contract that protects the city that you are talking about Article 11.1. There is only one real system and the system that is used in European unions that protects citizen which is called a precautionary principles as says when there is a substantial risk of harm you stop and you don't allow it and make the person that is proposing it prove that it will not harm. He read when an activity raises threats of harm to human health or environment precautionary measures should be taken even if cause and effect relationships haven't even have been proven yet. Are we going to be the guinea pigs to see if this new technology works or see what toxins that have not been identified because of the new process? Don't make the citizens of Allentown guinea pigs.

Mr. Anthony Gallagher, business representative Steamfitter Union 420, stated that he did see this model and one of his contractors were in the process of helping them make the model. He stated as Ms. Eichenwald informed them that it was only burning 15 pounds of waste. The only way they could get a permit is something of a small scale and when you're doing something on a small scale what you are doing is minimizing the same process just on a smaller scale to build the plan. It is his understanding that the process is working in Japan and Korea. This has been in commercial use for over five years if he is not mistaken. We are worried about emissions and if he understands it correctly, the building is pressurized which means there is no air escaping except the flute that goes through a scrubber and as a steamfitter they are involved in numerous buildings, refineries, nuclear power, and trash to steam. We have experience it all and our teachers are trained engineers and have seen this process and they are highly impressed with it. It seems to be a process that is at the cutting edge of technology. He commends all the work the Sierra Club does and all their efforts. This is advancement in technology that helps burn trash. It will keep admissions down from the incinerators and landfills which will be a problem eventually if we keep dumping. We have to come up with a solution and this seems to be the solution. Allentown has an opportunity to be on the cutting edge. It is private company doing it. If they don't meet the requirement take them off line. It is their money, their capital that is failing and Allentown is not. This is an opportunity for Allentown to show they are the leaders in this technology. This is green technology and the energy we are talking about and we need to replace oil. We all know we have to get off of it. Here is an opportunity on a small scale, but it is here. It will put people to work and give good paying jobs.

Mr. Rich Fegley, 1002 S. Bradford, stated that he is embarrassed to admit that a plan like this was still on the table for the city trash to energy plant. In a little bit of research and reading the backgrounds two of the things are transporting of trash and the Morning Call just mentioned in an article and flack about traffic coming downtown. A trash facility like this will only bring more garbage downtown and that will have to go through the streets. It is practically the heart of town. As someone who lives up on the hill above the constitution he hears the waste treatment plant that is running already currently by the river. He hears the motors and the fans that run down there. He could only imagine the size of this facility. We are trying to promote recycling as a restaurant who is now composting and over half if not close to seventy percent of their waste goes to be composted and none of that goes

into landfill. There is plenty of money that can go into recycling programs reducing the amount of waste that is going into landfill. If the city could take a \$3.5 million expense and reducing it by 33 percent and one way is to reduce the waste that the city is producing. Yes, the air is clean according to someone's standards. At some time it was allowable, but now heavy metals and that whole thing has change. Now, there is no heavy metals are allowed in our bodies. What changed? At one point we were told to eat butter, and now trans fats are banned in our foods. In order for that plant to be viable, they have to import more waste.

Mr. Daniel Poresky, 824 N. Berk Street, stated that although he is a member of the Allentown Environmental Advisory Council he is not talking on its behalf. He will not talk about the environmental concerns. He stated that he is not an expert on it, but has concerns as private citizen and his main concern has to do with time and costs. They talked about the problems that could possibly arise. The technology, this is cutting edge he is told. Yet, cutting edge thirty-five years ago, and this is a thirty-year contract what were some of the cutting edge things, cordless phones. The technology that this is incorporating, we are only contracting for this technology; there is nothing in the contract that says if they always have to be on the cutting edge. Ten years from now, when something comes out that's better you don't have a choice to adopt that. What are you going to do? What if they found out that it is a pollutant coming out, but the DEP is not regulating it. They don't have to shut down. You can't take them off-line unless they are violating a contract and they are not violating the contract unless it is in the contract. You can't know what is going to be involved I five, ten, fifteen, twenty years. You are committed to increase the amount of money you are paying every year. You are starting at \$5 million and by the time this is thirty-five years goes by, it is almost triple the amount every single year and you don't have a choice. He stated that he does not understand why they want to take those risks when right now the system that you are using is not good, but you have control over whether you are going to change it. If something better comes along to eat up those things in the sewage treatment plant (better bacteria) you could adopt it. If someone else comes up and say we are going to do, but we are only going to give you a five year contract and we are going to do it off-site and take it out of town to do it, you can contract with them for a few years. To contract with someone that you have no idea what the future brings and lock yourself into it seems totally irresponsible to the next generation.

Ms. Judith Trayroth, 314 Ott Street, Bethlehem, stated that she is so impressed with this meeting. She stated that she has a second home in Lehigh Township Carbon County where they occasionally have to the police come because of fist fighting because someone did not pay their garbage bill. She stated that she is not impressed with this project. She agrees that it should not go forward. It is historic that poor people have slaughter houses next to them, and garbage and crap goes next to them. She stated that she does not know if they will ever stop that. We are human beings and don't change that much. She stated that when she went to Mexico City ten years ago, her sinuses cleared up and it was a volcano going off there at the time. She stated that she lived in the Lehigh Valley for 25 years and her sinuses are shot. That is not cancerous that is the level of pollution in the Valley. We are number thirteen in America and you want even more She stated that she heard Krancer that is the head of the DEP ironically guest an eco-festival in some upscale festival in a suburb of Philadelphia, he does not have a clue or believes that it is a single thing that hyperfracking for gas does harm to human being. He is in complete denial of that. We want the DEP in charge of telling us how much emissions that are ok.

Concerned Resident, 1051 N. 19<sup>th</sup> Street, asked if this plan is considered a prototype and is the process considered a prototype.

Mr. Sale stated that the combustion system is not a prototype. It is a commercial combustor that is used in Europe. He stated that he had the opportunity and an advantage over DEB which is another consultant and he had the opportunity to travel to Germany with an engineer with the City of Allentown and they observed the operations for the whole scale of combustions burning that process of waste. The RRS and the water treatment system are also full-scale commercial operations. There is one he knows that is in operation in Japan. Unfortunately, he has not seen it in operation.

Concerned Resident asked why is there so many negatives that this might not working then from what he heard in the beginning of this meeting. He personally believes that there is not enough viable information presented to Council on this. To invest in thirty-five years is a long time to invest in something that you are not sure you are going to get. He thinks that they are risking a lot. He stated that the ladies and gentlemen brought up other viable

concerns such as environmental and as far as the testing, the air pollution and the ground water pollution. He just doesn't think Council is informed enough. He does not think that the company presented enough information. He stated that he does not know. Where is the slideshow presentation, where were the plans. This is a big risk. You need more information to vote on this stuff. We need more facts and information. Are there other plants in the US with a three step process?

Mr. Sale stated that this will be the first plant in the US.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that she would like to point out that not only it will be the first plant in the United States, but even in Japan, Germany, and Korea the individual components are operating, but no place are they operating all the modular components. This will be it.

Mr. Martin Boxenbond, stated that the health of the people is a major concern and he is trying to see if the contract protects the City of Allentown with any liability. He wanted to comment to the gentleman from the Steamfitters about the job possibilities. He stated that he is on the steering committee for the alliance of communities in the Lehigh Valley. He stated that they support the statement of the Sierra Club and very much on board on what Al Wurth said earlier there are two things that Al Wurth's letter that address jobs and the economy that is worth mentioning here that if they were to pursue green alternatives that involve recycling and recovery materials of waste and having the alternative energy that does not involve combustion there are many, many job possibilities there. He is concerned about working people and having a livelihood. There is greater likelihood of finding work in those industries. Secondly, it talks about the image of the city, what is going to draw businesses to establish themselves in the city if you have this kind of waste burning which will harm our economy development and does a waste facility attract other investment in the city. Will businesses relocate here because our sewer burner in the heart of town. That does not seem to be the case. He makes further the point that we don't have to worry about any competition for the mainline Philadelphia suburbs trying to battle us to have the facility there instead of here.

Mr. Ken Heffentrager asked besides the City Council the public is notified about this. He stated that not everyone has television and cable. He does not and besides coming here with seventy-five people at most here how do most people know about this. You represent the people in Allentown and to him if he walked around Allentown there are not too many people that know about this.

Mr. Guridy stated that they usually advertise it in the newspaper under the public forum.

Mr. Schlossberg stated to Mr. Heffentrager that they were letters sent out and he is not exactly sure of where. He stated that the east side was notified via a letter. He stated that there were two public meetings.

Mr. Ken Keffentrager stated that the letter went to the east side and there are 118,000 people in the city. There should have been 118,000 letters sent out and letters sent out to Bethlehem too because it will affect them also. How much will it cost Allentown if we have to go back to the landfill system? That's money out of the citizens of Allentown that does not seem right.

Mr. Jim Bass, 527 N. Howard, stated that he was thinking that they were talking about garbage trucks maybe you could utilize trains. In the earlier 60s he happened to be a summer employee, college student working at Kline's Island and he does not know how he got assigned there, but was assigned to Kline's Island. In those days the plant was working above capacity and when they use to honey dip on the tanks and put everything on barrels and put in the dump truck to the city's sewer department and go over to the dump near the railroad yard and people on the eastside would boo that truck because of the smell and there was a human period for a few weeks when they were topping off the beds as the flushed out the tanks and they were not dry and the people on the eastside were complaining about the terrible odor. He stated that he read in the newspaper that the odor control crew is working on it and it was him.

Mr. Marcel Groan, Counsel for Delta Thermo, stated that originally he had prepared some remarks to be as flowery as possible, but finds himself in a strange position as some of them are. They have been involved in this process for 3 ½ years. The administration and council have been as transparent as humanly possible. This matter has come to

council on at least six different occasions because they had to vote on grants that were given and they made presentations. They have given in front of Council to the best of his recollection four or five times. They had two public meetings, one of the eastern end where there was a crowd that was about three to four times this size and when they presented their plans for the better part of two hours there was not one person who objected to what they saw or had a problem that they developed in great detail. You have sent your consultant engineer, Mr. Sale, as well as one of your staff people from Germany to look at the combustion chamber and ensure that it works because from an emissions perspective the combustion chamber is the one you need to look at because that is where the emissions come from. They determine that the combustion chamber is not only safe, but emitted relatively little. It is minimal. They have gone through thirty drafts that have meat to it. It is not just an agreement that does not say anything. The agreement was prepared, not only with lawyers, but in conjunction with your engineers to ensure that all the engineering issues that have been raised today or tonight in some fashion will appropriately be addressed. He stated that he views himself as an environmentalist all his life. As someone who believes in this project more than anything he has ever done professionally in forty-four years because it is important to the environment and nothing else. He thinks they need to take a look at what they are doing right now. You are doing three things with your trash one you are recycling and that is a good thing and this project will continue your recycling project and in no way affect it. Second, you are landfilling and we all agree that landfilling is an outdated, not very good way of getting rid of waste. He stated that he does not know much, but since they are looking out thirty years forward he knows sometime in the thirty-five years most landfills will be done and will no longer be able to accept trash and the government will try to eliminate them because if they are an intrinsic danger to the water supply because of the methane gas that they pull off. All of the scientific and environmental communities agree that this is a lousy way to get rid of waste. It may be the only way, but if it is a way you got to do it. Your sludge is presently being taken and spread over farmland and the regulations say that you can't put it on farmland that something is growing and people eat so it is taken and put on farmland that animals eat and that you then eat. It is only a matter of time that you wake up and say that this is a lousy way of getting rid of sludge. He stated that he wants to be respectful to all of the environmentalist and respectful to everyone here because he understands their concerns, but he is astonished about the misinformation and the lack of attempt to gather information before you throw things out and say they are real because they are not. He stated that he wants to talk about the system itself. He stated that the combustion chamber is the most important because that is where the emissions come from. When Mr. Sale and Mr. Bob Ridge went to Germany they saw the combustion chamber and were able to see what came out and what was emitted and realized that was better than any standards that we have here. What the resource recovery system and the water system does is prepares what normally go into the combustion chamber and gets rid of a whole lot of dioxins and a lot of stuff and make it much cleaner. What we are doing in Atlantic County right now is put a Scale Model. He stated to Ms. Eichenwald that you cannot build a 150 ton scale model. It is impossible, but with the scale model you put everything there exactly to scale it down. Mr. Gallagher said and he saw it what you do is see the RSS what does it do. You see trash coming in, water coming out and see the center spinning it and the water dries and see ultimately the product that goes into the combustion chamber is not the trash and the sludge that went into the Resource and Recovery System in the first place. He brought some samples. He stated that he did not bring samples from Japan or Korea, but it is the same garbage and the same crap. The odor inside the building cannot escape and it would not be an odor issue because it gets processed. It stays in the building. This is not an incinerator. We have said it over and over again. He apologized if people never came to the public meetings and never came to the Council meetings. All of that took place. He stated that they are concerned about a huge incinerator that he sees when he drives to Florida on the Florida Turnpike and when he drives around the blue routes and he sees at Plymouth Meeting. They are monstrosities. They take pure garbage and don't do anything to pretreat it. They throw in what they get. They throw the plastics in. The whole issue of dioxins a lot of that comes from plastics. There are no dioxins left, the plastics are gone the chlorides are gone. He stated that he cannot tell them that it is zero emissions, but he could tell them even without the pre-treatment system all the studies have shown that the dioxin emissions under new waste to energy plants that are existing throughout the world by as much as 90 percent, they believe no matter what number they are they are going to take that number and reduce it significantly by a pretreatment system. He stated that somebody said if they get rid of the waste, all they are doing is creating more waste because there is no reason to recycle. They are not changing the recycling system. He stated that he knows that they live in Allentown, but if Whitehall has waste it is waste even if it goes to Allentown or not. We are not adding any waste to anything. The city in its wisdom asked for additional capacity because they could not foresee everything and wanted to be able to utilize that additional capacity. He stated that he spoke to the Mayor at the beginning of the week and he will put this in the letter or give a side letter that Number 1. The excess capacity that

they are talking about is equivalent of one garbage truck a day. That is it. Number 2. Both the city and Delta and committed to try to get from hauler within the city first, but we can't guarantee they will do that. You have a whole bunch of people running around with garbage whether or not they are private haulers that pick up commercial stuff and put it somewhere else. If we could get it to come to us and the city will help us that has always been our perspective and always what we want to do. The city can't be bound by it because it interferes with the economics of it. You have today, hundreds of trucks of garbage that goes through Allentown. It is I-78 that goes through New York and goes west. This is an environmental thing where we are trying to prevent the need in the future starting with this project not to happen. It is environmentally sound. It is the opposite of what the complaints are. Somebody mentioned rightfully so that they questioned about DEP. The agreement says a number of things. The agreement says that they are obligated to meet all of the DEP standards. Trust that they are not satisfied with that either. He stated that we said in the beginning not only will we meet them, we told you that we will meet the EU standards which are far more stringent and the Japanese standards that are even more stringent. We also have language in the agreement which permits the city to come and monitor any one of these things any time it feels it's necessary as long as it is reasonable with reasonable notice. That is something that is not required, but the city asked for it and we agreed to it. It makes all the sense in the world. There will be monitoring on most of these stuff on a fairly regular basis. Whatever is required and whatever works out on the actual operations. This is not an incinerator. Mr. Marc Feller did a phenomenal job in representing you crafted the incinerator agreement in Plymouth Meeting. This is not an incinerator is not the same it was twenty years ago. There has been a tremendous amount of updates, tremendous amount of improvement and yet you and I will agree, it is not good enough. It is far from good enough. We are not an incinerator. We start with combustion chambers that your engineer has seen which throws off very little in the first place and we were not satisfied that they should just take a combustion chamber. We had experts in the waste business that came to his clients and said that you don't need this Japanese or Korean system just burn it in the combustion chambers. It works fine, it meets everybody's standards, but we did not feel that it was environmentally sound for us. We wanted to be cutting edge. We took a system that was originally designed in Japan to get rid of medical waste and you can't get anything worse than medical waste and this system is able to take medical waste and subsequently burnt without any other stuff that is bad in the environment. We wanted a good system, an environmentally sound system and what they believe they accomplished. He stated that he takes great offense when people say they are building something next to poor people. That is not fair, it is wrong and before you say it, you better know your facts. We are building this next to a sewer plant. I am not saying that poor people are not living next to the sewer plant, but we are not building it in a new place, it is next to the sewer plant. Someone said thirty-five years from now it's going to be different. You are right, it's going to be different. Your sewer plant was built eighty years ago, and it is different. You don't build something like this because it is not going to be here in five years, you can't afford to. You don't have a choice, we either move forward with something cutting edge and environmentally upgraded from time to time because it has to or continue to landfill. Those are your choices and someone is going to tell you that you can't landfill any more and you will have to figure it out all over again. We don't want to fight with the environmental community at all. We are you.

Mr. Marco Bonilla stated that they threw everything including the kitchen sink at the same time. He will try to answer that. He stated that he did talk to Mr. McGuire from time to time and they talked about some of the issues. He stated that he answered most of them. We attended all the meetings you asked us to participate and we are an open book to everybody. He stated that he is surprised that they did not call him. He stated that he is the founder and COO of the company. He does not appreciate the good points. He spent a good amount of his life in Europe and he says that for an important reason. He stated that they will expect him to say good things about who they are. He stated he wanted to give them the facts on how other people who have studied this represented. This is not his voice, but the voice of people that studied this such as the environmentalist, the waste to energy Institute of Columbia University who is arguably the premier institution that has looked at some of the facts. Perception can become reality in a public forum, but the information enrichment that they have on the internet all information is available to you. Let me share with you what they say to address some points that you have indicated to us. There was a study done by individual for Columbia University's Earth Engineering Center. The study says in conclusion there are more than 600 hundred modern successful waste to energy facilities operating worldwide including eighty-nine in the United States. All of which have been in operation for several years more than fifteen years new facility in the last fifteen years. They conclude without any significant pollution. It must be noted the MSW landfill are now band in Europe. As an environmental he is concerned that in this country they still dump stuff and our children will suffer for that. A recent German environmental also reported the negligent dioxin emission from 6 to 6 waste to energy plants in the nation.

We are talking about 150 tons. Have you ever been to a waste facility in this country, thousands of waste produced within your city limits. It is important to look at facts. He stated that there was a gentleman here that says they have to test thoroughly and they will so the emissions will get lower. It is great advice. If you burn in your backyard some of the waste and leaves you are going to be producing more dioxins than our facility. He stated about odor everything is filtered and they open the gates for the trucks to go in and they close the gate immediately and everything is processed within 45 square facility. He stated that they were excited to work with the citizens. We requested and we agreed in some of the committees that you will work with us throughout the time and some of you said you will be there and we took names and we said absolutely be the new Allentown. That is still available to all of you. You are concerned about health and I am too. There are no materials that produce more heavy metal than sewer sludge. The 60,000 toxins, hormones, antibiotics and all kinds of things that environmentalists should be up in arms. There are 33 states in this country that allow what we do today. Do you know that we spread sludge in lawn where children play and he has not heard anyone say anything about that, it is mind-boggling to him that there are no regulations about that. He stated that they also stated that with their technology, they will remove the heavy metals from the sludge. That is a fact. There is an international patent, the MIA of Japan has a patent and is available and he could give a translation and it shows you how it is and it also takes the dioxins. It is the simplest thing in the world and when things are simple work the best. High pressure, high temperature steam and as a result of that it reacts with the municipal solid waste and breaks and takes the chlorine that is organic and converts it into salt. Do you allow the system of Japan and Europe the system to work if it does not apply with the stringent regulations. Go to Europe and find composting, we are not even close in this country. We are bringing the latest technology from Germany and he is excited about sharing the technology with you. Another study says multiple health risks that shows estimated cancer risks for exposure to MSW landfills are 5 times those of waste to energy facilities. We do have an air permit. We applied for the air permit. We meet regularly with DEP and comply with EPA. We have to comply with the regulations. The regulations for dioxins today are one hundred times less than what it was ten years ago and if we are working in this city, we have to comply with whatever the regulations are.

Mr. Schlossberg stated that in the course of listening to all the speakers speak he did a little digging and he looked up recent news stories regarding landfills and he literally could not make it up if he tried and a story was posted thirty-five minutes ago from the Express Times and the title is Lower Saucon Township landfill wants to expand Apple Butter Road Location. IESI wants to expand its landfill on Apple Butter Road in Lower Saucon Township in Bethlehem by 45 acres. The company's landfill only has 4.1 years of capacity left and is seeking to expand the landfill. The local residents are opposed to it and are extremely unhappy from the odor of the landfill as well as the trucks, and potential damage to ground water and the environment and goes on to say township supervisors are opposed to set expansion. There are multiple stories articles like this and the constant controversy Williams Township about the landfill and none of us were elected to represent any of the folks in Williams Township we are elected to represent Allentown. We could potentially in the next few years with landfill capacity and if we run out of local capacity than the trash has to be transported to further away sites including New York and New Jersey and for those who think that our taxes and fees are high now, just wait and see what happens. Landfills are not an environmentally sound model. The landfills create long problems to the immediate area as well as to animal life and water sources within the affected area. What we have in front of us is the opportunity to create a new solutions that will not only dispose of our gas which he believes is an environmentally sound matter, but would provide significant savings to the city in the tune of potentially of \$33 million over thirty-years, roughly. Nothing is guaranteed, but what is certainly not guaranteed is the present. He stated that he has to put it out there because it has to be discussed that the status quo is dangerous for the City of Allentown and the taxpayers of Allentown. We have an opportunity to not only get around that, but to create jobs and save \$33 million in the next thirty-five years.

Mr. O'Connell stated that to Mr. Gallagher and union officials he does appreciate what they are saying that this would create jobs for the local citizens of Allentown and the Lehigh Valley. He stated that he does have reservations about this project. Mr. Bonilla stated we still dump stuff in our landfills and our children will suffer for that. He stated that he totally agrees. Mr. Groan stated that he could not tell us that there are zero emissions and he totally agrees with that. Mr. Young stated early on that kind of sparked this discussion that we were misinformed by saying technology don't have risks. He stated that he totally agreed with that and is more concerned about the environmental issues and he does not want to risk our children and our grandchildren and the future of what could possibly happen therefore he will be voting no on this project.

Mr. Schweyer stated that in sports you never want to know the name of the umpire because the only time you do is when they screw up. We never want to think about garbage until it's an issue right in front of us. We don't think about garbage or sewage until something is right in front of us. We flush the toilet and assume it goes to outer space, Bethlehem or New Jersey. We have no idea where it goes. He stated that he lived in the first ward for a while and took a quick look at the map and finds himself in a unique position on Council who lives closest to this on this dais this proposed plan. It really isn't in a residential neighborhood or the sewage treatment plant being there for eighty years. The question about additional garbage traffic, if anyone drives on N. 4<sup>th</sup> Street as he does every day JB Mascaro and Son corporate facility including trash trucks located on Basin Street right there. If anywhere in the Lehigh Valley going to be a waste to energy facility he would imagine as a group where would we put it. We would put it next to an existing sewage plant, perhaps in an area where we already have garbage trucks with heavy traffic for haulers and already zoned industrial land with god knows what kind of environmental issues that are actually under the land right now adjacent to a railroad. This is really the only place we would put it. The environmental community himself included would be aghast if they turned up another farm or ripped our farmland and put it there. We would be aghast if we would put it in a non-industrial area. It is next to a place where garbage trucks are parked and adjacent to a railroad line. If we were starting a city from scratch, we wouldn't put it there. We are not starting a city from scratch we are 250 years old. We have only what's in front of us. Do we or do we not as a community wants a waste to energy treatment plant. This is not a city project, this is a private development with private developers who are using private money to invest and the city is basically saying, yes, we will be a customer of yours. Do we or do we not want to be a customer to a waste to energy treatment plant located in the only area in the Lehigh Valley that sort of meets those criterias. He stated does he have environmental concerns on what may happen, of course I do. He stated that he has the second youngest child on this dais and yes, we share those sentiments and at the end of the day, if we want to do this and look at alternative solutions of what we put in the toilet and what we put in a black garbage bag and put outside our house twice a week. If we want to look at an alternative other than that, this is the alternative and the only thing that is in front of us. He stated that he does not see a solution if they were to draw a conclusion to waste to energy that makes more sense than this location. This has been vetted for two and half years.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that with all due respect, she is sure that Mr. Groan and Mr. Bonilla love their communities as much as she loves her and she is sure they want to protect their families as she wants to protect hers and wants to protect citizens of their community as she wants to do with hers. How come this process is not being developed in the communities in which you live?

Mr. Groan stated that it was designed for people in relatively small communities and for people around 100,000. It was designed to ensure that it was not going to be a big monstrosity and so it what all the incinerators are. This is not an incinerator, it is a combustion chambers. He stated that they were looking for something that was about 100,000 and he is friendly with the mayor because he appreciates what he is trying to do with the community and he shares much of his vision, not all of it, but much of it. We were talking and he said it would be great in Allentown. He stated that Ms. Eichenwald of all people know that his two children went to school here. You know that I love this community and have done a whole lot of things to try to help and back it. He stated that if he lived in Allentown, he would be in much in favor of it as he is standing here not living in Allentown.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that there are many processes not designed for huge municipalities, but they certainly could have taken over a smaller part of that municipality. It does not have to be one facility that takes the waste and the sludge. Thank you for your answer.

Mr. Bonilla stated that he and Mr. Groan live about a mile from each other in Montgomery County and they serve a large waste management company that was built in Plymouth Township and production was in 1993. He stated that he worked on that facility. The state not willing to grant expansion and landfill prices have gone up and the county felt they had an obligation to find waste disposal in municipalities in the Easton part of the municipalities. Twenty-two municipalities signed on to a very demanding contract. This plant was built with 1200 tons a day and back then it was the only way to do it technologically. People come from all over the world to see it. They used a German system operated by a French company that never operated a plan like this before using this German technology. This is also on county land. It appeared that this land would be a waste land and no one would want to move nearby and there would be no commercial development and now it is surrounded by a high density commercial and

shopping center and thriving commercial community. The reason why we don't have a plant like this near us is because it was a huge investment in 1989 when they started financing. They have a plant that will continue to operate for 30 to 40 years. It has been upgraded on a continuous basis. This is a different facility and the state requires upgrades and requires components for these facilities to control mercury. He stated that they would have been better off having a facility like the Delta facility because it is cleaner and you take care of your own waste. People in his township take it to Plymouth Township. Now, there is new technology to have smaller efficient plants in each community. Each community can say they will be responsible for their own waste disposal. They don't want to impose on other communities.

Ms. Eichenwald stated to Mr. Feller that she is sure it was not his intention, but he peaked her interest on the company that established that because she said from the very beginning that one of the problems she has with this is there is no place this particular unique system exists. She stated that he described to her something that she might not have a greater interest in because it is proven and had success and it appears to her that the citizens in the community has been pleased with that.

Mr. Feller stated that it is an incinerator and a system that is based in raw municipal waste and is designed for a very, very large multi community usage. You can't operate in large communities and there is a huge investment that has to be made for pollution controls because how the waste is burnt and as Mr. Bonilla said they are not building these things anymore because you can't justify building something like this based on the technologies that are available.

Ms. Eichenwald stated to Mr. Feller that by telling her that they are not building this anymore, it concerns her. Just as Mr. Poresky said this contract is for thirty-five years and she will borrow a line from what Mr. Wurth said that it is like they had bought an electric typewriter and that was going to be the means which we were going to communicate for thirty-five years which means the newer technology would no longer be available to us.

Mr. Feller stated that if you build a school in the community and you go to school and that school building will hopefully last ten, twenty, thirty years, but ten years later you see new schools being built with state-of-the-art wired to an audio visual computer system Wi-Fi systems and I guess you would say that I will never build a school in the first place because I will just wait ten years when it is better technology and in fact they will have upgrades.

Ms. Eichenwald stated for her it does not work. It comes at no surprise because of the questions she has asked over the course of this whole process she too will vote no and the reason she will vote no is because they are talking about not only a business venture, but the air she breathes and everyone in this community not only in Allentown, but the surrounding environment the community will breathe and her grandchildren will breathe. She is very concerned and she does agree with Mr. Schlossberg that a landfill is not the ultimate answer, but she is not willing to take the responsibility of herself to vote for something that she is so concerned about. She stated that she did a great amount of reading and is not a scientist, but she did a great deal of reading about the dioxins and their toxicities and they could be carcinogens and she is really concerned on making a decision and she stated to Mr. Schweyer she is concerned about the ethical responsibility about sitting here is this dais one of six people to vote on the dais and saying those people that live on the eastside should be the closest to have to breathe the air that we don't know what will come in the future. It is an ethical responsibility and weighs heavily upon her shoulders that she will be making the decision. Perhaps there is no better place than the City of Allentown to put it, but when you think about it you are making a decision about the very air that we will breathe. She is concerned and most people that they heard tonight have a vested interest. The ones that really don't have a vested interest are those that have come to us with environmental concerns and the only interest they have is what will be better for the quality of life for the citizens of this community. She stated that she will be very sorry to sit here in ten years or fifteen years and see that there is a process that would have been developed that would have been better than this. Throughout the country if you look at what is going on, people want to send their waste away. This process demands that we bring waste in and eleven percent more waste than we bring in as citizens of Allentown. The city of San Francisco has reduced their waste consumption by 77 percent and we are talking about bringing more waste in here and more trucks coming in, more air pollution that would come in so all of those reasons she needs to vote no.

Mr. Gurdy stated that he heard everybody especially the public and there were things that worried him that it looks like they did not know the information. Things like is this an incinerator and is this what want for the city. People

talked about what will happen to recycling. This is a city that has received awards for recycling our waste and our metal, plastics, cartons, and paper. That will continue. He stated that he heard people talk about the air and what kind of is going to come out of that and he was told that the people that are experts told us that it is going to be building and pressurized and air leaving the building will be minimum and the emissions will be kept at a minimum and controlled by DEP. He stated that he heard it is an archaic type of technology and cutting edge technology. He stated that Mr. Schweyer allotted to this and when he came to this country thirty-five years ago he came to Bethlehem and often came to Allentown on Hanover and as soon as he got to Hanover Avenue and the bridge on Hamilton Street he did not know what it was, but the smell propelled him out the city. He remembers Councilwoman Emma Tropiano took it amongst herself to sleep in the sewage plant area as a way to say we have to do something. He concerns are the financials and we have our expert Mr. Scott Shearer that assured us that we are doing the right thing.

Mr. Shearer, PFM – Council's Advisor of Financials, stated that they heard this and the ability to pine on this technology. He stated that one thing he can say, he is not an engineer and does not talk about the technology. He has a major role in the team effort that he saw from all parties involved from his firm, the special Counsels, and both engineering firms and other city officials. The assumptions that he showed to them and the models that they built that did not just come from PFM, or Mr. John Sale, or GBB, that came from everyone's input and they would not release that to City Council unless they had an agreement from all parties on all those assumptions and the way that the model would work. With that model and those assumptions everybody was on board with what was shown last week. PFM is not engineering experts, we are financial experts and we worked hard with all parties involved in this and making sure we were comfortable what we were providing City Council this. We wanted to take the lengthy contract and put it in dollars and cents. We were not going to bring anything to City Council unless we had the whole group on board with the assumptions and the way the model worked.

Mr. Guridy stated that he feels comfortable about the financing. He stated that he personally taken trash away. He has property in Bethlehem and in Bethlehem we don't collect trash, you have to hire a hauler. If you are doing a construction job, you have to take the trash yourself. We have people here that would take it to Apple Butter Road Landfill. He stated that he sees tons of trucks trying to dump when he is dumping his garbage and that is the alternative and that is expensive. This may not be the perfect alternative and the perfect plant, but what is the alternative.

**Resolution to enter the Agreement failed, 3 – 3 (Eichenwald, Mota, O'Connell)**

#### **14. RESOLUTIONS ON FIRST READING:**

##### **R8 Appointment of Francis Dougherty as Managing Director**

**Resolution passed, 6 – 0**

#### **15. NEW BUSINESS**

Mr. Guridy stated that he has an issue regarding the sinkhole. He asked did everybody one get a letter from Juan Velazquez and Helen Cordero. He asked what is going on with the houses that were near the sinkhole and those that were asked to evacuate and more work has to be done on this. These people are apparently out and cannot get their belongings.

Mr. O'Connell asked could he give Mr. Dougherty his copy because the mayor was copies, but Mr. Dougherty was not copied.

Mr. Guridy stated please and thank you, Mr. O'Connell. He asked Mr. Dougherty once he has a chance to digest this letter to please find out what is going on with the owners of the property and get back to us in a couple of days and we will need to take some action on how we will proceed.

Ms. Eichenwald stated that serious issue is the lack of the ability to get insurance and now it is after the fact, but in other kind of disasters, fire and the gas explosion they had the possibility of insurance, but these homeowners had no sinkhole insurance.

Mr. Gurdy stated that Ms. Eichenwald is correct and part of the issue is that they are still citizens of our city and they have insurance on that and they were displaced and we are the authorities of the city and we are telling them that they can't come back to their homes and they are losing their livelihood.

**16. GOOD AND WELFARE**

**17. ADJOURNED: 12: 11 PM**

*Council meetings are held on the first and third Wednesday of each month beginning at 7:30 pm in Council Chambers. For copies of the agenda or meeting announcements, please visit our website at [www.allentownpa.gov](http://www.allentownpa.gov), or contact the Clerk at [Michael.Hanlon@allentownpa.gov](mailto:Michael.Hanlon@allentownpa.gov) to receive an email notice of the meetings.*